

From: [Marylou Soscia](#)
To: [Soscia, Marylou](#)
Subject: Fw: Comment: Columbia River Toxics Reduction Working Group:
Date: Tuesday, April 25, 2017 11:19:36 AM

Mary Lou Soscia | Columbia River Coordinator | US EPA

805 S.W. Broadway, Suite 500 | Portland, OR 97205

503.326.5873

www.epa.gov/columbiariver | <https://twitter.com/EPAcolumbia>

----- Forwarded by Marylou Soscia/R10/USEPA/US on 04/25/2017 11:19 AM -----

From: "brentfoster" <brentfoster@gorge.net>
To: "Joseph F Rinella" <jrinella@usgs.gov>, <deanna.e.conners@state.or.us>, <john.gear@state.or.us>, <akol461@ecy.wa.gov>, <salannananegos@ctuir.com>, Rick Albright/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <ALDRICH.Greg@deq.state.or.us>, <alec_maule@usgs.gov>, Adrienne Allen/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <apaulson@usgs.gov>, Karl Arne/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <ashley.kaiser@urscorp.com>, <aunan.lauri@deq.state.or.us>, <bburnell@deq.idaho.gov>, <billmcf@usgs.gov>, (b) (6) [REDACTED], Eric Blischke/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Julie Bowen/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <brandy.duff@grandronde.org>, <cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov>, <cbarton@usgs.gov>, <charles_j_henry@usgs.gov>, Tracy Chelis/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <Christensen.jeff@deq.state.or.us>, <chris_moody@urscorp.com>, (b) (6) [REDACTED], <coffeeen.greg@deq.state.or.us>, Keith Cohon/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Peter Conterras/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Ben Cope/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Cox/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, David Croxton/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <cude.curts@deq.state.or.us>, Renee Dagseth/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <Dan.Gambetta@noaa.gov>, <dana@yakama.com>, <dana_c_ward@rl.gov>, <dave.mcbride@doh.wa.gov>, <dave.stone@state.or.us>, Dana Davoli/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <dnor461@ecy.wa.gov>, Gerald Dodo/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <Don.Essig@deq.idaho.gov>, <Don_Steffeck@fws.gov>, <donald@yakama.com>, <donna.b.ebner@nwp01.usace.army.mil>, <donna.morgans@state.or.us>, Scott Downey/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <dpee461@ecy.wa.gov>, <dsan461@ecy.wa.gov>, <dsehgal@wstr.bes.org>, Bruce Duncan/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Daniel Duncan/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <dwa461@ecy.wa.gov>, <earthur@cowlitz.org>, Thomas Eaton/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Lorraine Edmond/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <enilsen@usgs.gov>, <fjloge@ucdavis.edu>, <fmccormick@fs.fed.us>, <FOSTER.eugene.p@deq.state.or.us>, <gary.bahr@agni.idaho.gov>, John Gabrielson/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Larry Gadbois/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Mike Gearheard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <geneshippentower@ctuir.com>, <ghoff@pn.usbr.gov>, <gilles.bruse@deq.state.or.us>, <gjfuhrer@usgs.gov>, <glturney@usgs.gov>, Roger Gorke/DC/USEPA/US@EPA, <gwenc@nezperce.org>, Julie Hagensen/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Sandra Halstead/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <harman.charles@deq.state.or.us>, <hb461@ECY.WA.GOV>, Alan Henning/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <howp@critfc.org>, Chip Humphrey/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <ja.ward@ pnl.gov>, <james.Meador@noaa.gov>, <james.r.adams@usace.army.mil>, <jay_davis@fws.gov>, <jeff.baker@grandronde.org>, <jeffrey.lockwood@noaa.gov>, <jeffrey_wallace@urscorp.com>, Jannine Jennings/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <Jeremy_Buck@fws.gov>, <Jerry.boese@ross-assoc.com>, <westjew@dfw.wa.gov>, <Jim.R.Reese@nwd01.usace.army.mil>, <jlmorace@usgs.gov>, <john.s.wakeman@usace.army.mil>, <john_p_sands@rl.gov>, <johnson.keith@deq.state.or.us>, <jones@lcrep.org>, <Joseph.Masso@nwp01.usace.army.mil>, <jppiccininni@bpa.gov>, <jpri461@ecy.wa.gov>, <jschwartz@jsanet.com>, <jRuff@NWCouncil.org>, <jthomas@yakama.com>, <juniperd@nezperce.org>, <kathleenfeehan@ctuir.com>, Sylvia Kawabata/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <kdavis@oda.state.or.us>, Dru Keenan/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Christine Kelly/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Lon Kissinger/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, David Kulman/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <l.bingler@ pnl.gov>, Joanne Labaw/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Robert Lackey/COR/USEPA/US@EPA, <larry.caton@state.or.us>, Phil Larsen/COR/USEPA/US@EPA, Phil Larsen/COR/USEPA/US@EPA, <Laura.L.Hicks@nwp01.usace.army.mil>, <leah@yakama.com>, <leary@lcrep.org>, <leostewart@ctuir.com>, <linda.tiokasin@ihs.gov>, <littlejoe@yakama.com>, <Liz.Carr@DOH.WA.GOV>, <lmfrans@usgs.gov>, Bruce Long/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <lut.agnes@deq.state.or.us>, <lyndal.l.johnson@noaa.gov>, Lisa Macchio/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Mark Macintyre/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <curran@battelle.org>, <Michael.karnosh@grandronde.org>, Laurie Mann/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <Mark.D.Siipola@nwp01.usace.army.mil>, <marriott@lcrep.org>, Don Martin/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <Mary.Arkosh@noaa.gov>, <masterson.kevin@deq.state.or.us>, <mattgerbrandt@ctuir.com>, <mccarthy@usgs.gov>, <mgil461@ECY.WA.GOV>, <mmckay@wstr.bes.org>, <nancy.kohn@ pnl.gov>, Walt Nelson/NEW/USEPA/US@EPA, Tony Olsen/COR/USEPA/US@EPA, John Olson/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <oneilsmo@dfw.wa.gov>, John Palmer/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Amber Parara/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Richard Parkin/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <patti.bailey@colvilletribes.com>, <pedersen.dick@deq.state.or.us>, <pinj@critfc.org>, Michelle Pirzadeh/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Derek Poon/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, David Powers/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Christine Psyk/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <rachael@columbiariverkeeper.org>, <relwood@yakama.com>, <rl.dirkes@ pnl.gov>, <rlaw461@ecy.wa.gov>, <robert.c.anderson@noaa.gov>, <richardson@wstribes.org>, (b) (6) [REDACTED], Helen Rueda/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Joel Salter/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, (b) (6) [REDACTED], <schwarz.bob@deq.state.or.us>, Jon Schweiss/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <ssrander@bpa.gov>, <stanv@ctsi.nsn.us>, Fran Stefan/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <stuartharris@ctuir.com>, <susan.c.hughs@state.or.us>, <swaste@nwncouncil.org>, Sally Thomas/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <timothy.j.sherman@usace.army.mil>, <tombailor@ctuir.com>, <tomd@ctsi.nsn.us>, <toni_davidson@fws.gov>, Tom Townsend/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Yvonne Vallette/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Paula VanHaagen/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Watson/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, James Werntz/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <wken461@ECY.WA.GOV>, <wolgammott.mitch@deq.state.or.us>, Leigh Woodruff/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <jennifer_bayer@usgs.gov>, Ann Williamson/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Matt Gubitosa/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Socorro Rodriguez/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Marylou Soscia/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Tracie Nadeau/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, <mcleod@battelle.org>, <lchulstr@wch-rcc.com>, <claudia.brow@noaa.gov>, Brad Carter/R10/USEPA/US@EPA, Michael Cox/R10/USEPA/US@EPA,

Date: 02/12/2008 03:56 PM

Subject: RE: Comment: Columbia River Toxics Reduction Working Group:

I share the concerns re: how we can measure a 10% goal absent good baseline data and problems with monitoring variability, but think it's still really important to have some numeric goals but maybe add goals like those suggested by Joe. Hopefully by highlighting our lack of baseline info priority toxics we will help create the funding to gather this data quickly and that the data is robust enough to be able to serve as a valuable reference point for a later assessment of our progress.

I also think we should consider another numeric goal for "Known Source Reductions" that would reflect a tally of load reductions that are achieved through specific cleanups or new pollution controls measures. Columbia Riverkeeper is starting to do this with our Clean Water Act enforcement actions against point sources- and for several sites we can now document that requiring a discharger to adopt a new control technology resulted in a toxics load decrease of 800 pounds of toxic X or a 50 to 90% reductions in annual toxic loads from the facility. State agencies could pretty easily do similar calculations during NPDES permit renewals and Riverkeeper is now finalizing our toxic load evaluation from the 25 NPDES "majors" currently discharging on the Columbia so there will soon be at least some reference point for point source majors.

Similarly, estimating PCB load reductions achieved through cleanup efforts at Bradford Island, or new cleanups at Hanford could be valuable for showing progress, but I presume not as simple of a task. This additional metric wouldn't answer the important question of how this is benefiting the receiving waters as in river data would, but I think showing toxics load reductions is important to build broader support for toxics redux on the Columbia and should be considered in addition to the broader 10% for the Columbia itself.

Thanks- brent foster, columbia riverkeeper

-----Original Message-----

From: Joseph F Rinella [mailto:jrinella@usgs.gov]
Sent: Monday, February 11, 2008 9:05 AM
To: deanna.e.conners@state.or.us; john.gear@state.or.us; akol461@ecy.wa.gov;
alannananegos@ctuir.com; albright.rick@epa.gov;
ALDRICH.Greg@deq.state.or.us; alec_maule@usgs.gov; Allen.adrianne@epa.gov;
apaulson@usgs.gov; Arne.karl@epa.gov; ashley.kaiser@urscorp.com;
te.or.us; bburnell@deq.idaho.gov; billmcf@usgs.gov;
(b) (6) ; Blischke.eric@epa.gov; bowen.julie@epa.gov;
nde.org; brentfoster@gorge.net; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov;
cbarton@usgs.gov; charles_j_henny@usgs.gov; chellis.tracy@epa.gov;
(b) (6) ; coffeeen.greg@deq.state.or.us; Cohon.keith@epa.gov;
.gov; Cope.ben@epa.gov; cox.michael@epa.gov;
Croxton.david@epa.gov; cude.curtis@deq.state.or.us; dagseth.renee@epa.gov;
Dan.Gambetta@noaa.gov; dana@yakama.com; dana_c_ward@rl.gov;
dave.mcbride@doh.wa.gov; dave.stone@state.or.us; davoli.dana@epa.gov;
dnor461@ecy.wa.gov; Dodo.gerald@epa.gov; Don.Essig@deq.idaho.gov;
Don_Steffeck@fws.gov; donald@yakama.com; donna.b.ebner@nwp01.usace.army.mil;
donna.morgans@state.or.us; Downey.scott@epa.gov; dpree461@ecy.wa.gov;
dsan461@ecy.wa.gov; dsehgal@wstribe.org; Duncan.bruce@epa.gov;
Duncan.daniel@epa.gov; dwal461@ecy.wa.gov; earthur@cowlitz.org;
Eaton.thomas@epa.gov; Edmond.lorraine@epa.gov; enilsen@usgs.gov;
fjloge@ucdavis.edu; fmccormick@fs.fed.us; FOSTER.eugene.p@deq.state.or.us;
gary.bahr@agri.idaho.gov; Gabrielson.john@epa.gov; gadbois.larry@epa.gov;
gearheard.mike@epa.gov; genesippentower@ctuir.com; ghoff@pn.usbr.gov;
gilles.bruce@deq.state.or.us; gjfuhrer@usgs.gov; glturney@usgs.gov;
Gorke.roger@epa.gov; gwenc@nezperce.org; Hagensen.julie@epa.gov;
halstead.sandra@epa.gov; harman.charles@deq.state.or.us; hbre461@ECY.WA.GOV;
Henning.alan@epa.gov; howp@critfc.org; Humphrey.chip@epa.gov;
ja.ward@ pnl.gov; James.Meador@noaa.gov; james.r.adams@usace.army.mil;
jay_davis@fws.gov; jeff.baker@grandronde.org; jeffrey.lockwood@noaa.gov;
jeffrey_wallace@urscorp.com; Jennings.jannine@epa.gov; Jeremy_Buck@fws.gov;
Jerry.boese@ross-assoc.com; westjew@dfw.wa.gov;
Jim.R.Reese@nwd01.usace.army.mil; jlmorace@usgs.gov;
john.s.wakeman@usace.army.mil; john_p_sands@rl.gov;
johnson.keith@deq.state.or.us; jones@lcrep.org;
Joseph.M.Dasso@nwp01.usace.army.mil; jpiccinni@bpa.gov;
jpri461@ecy.wa.gov; jxinella@usgs.gov; jschwartza@janet.com;
JRuff@NWCouncil.org; jthomas@yakama.com; juniperd@nezperce.org;
kathleenfeehan@ctuir.com; kawabata.sylvia@epa.gov; kdavis@oda.state.or.us;
Keenan.dru@epa.gov; kelly.christine@epa.gov; Kissinger.lon@epa.gov;
kulman.david@epa.gov; l.bingler@pnl.gov; labaw.joanne@epa.gov;
lackey.robert@epa.gov; larry.caton@state.or.us; larsen.phil@epa.gov;
Larsen.phil@epa.gov; Laura.L.Hicks@nwp01.usace.army.mil; leah@yakama.com;
leary@lcrep.org; leostewart@ctuir.com; linda.tiokasin@lhs.gov;
littlejoe@yakama.com; Liz.Carr@DOH.WA.GOV; lmfrans@usgs.gov;
Long.bruce@epa.gov; lut.agnes@deq.state.or.us; lyndal.l.johnson@noaa.gov;
Macchio.lisa@epa.gov; Macintyre.mark@epa.gov; curran@battelle.org;
Michael.karnosh@grandronde.org; Mann.Laurie@epa.gov;
Mark.D.Siipola@nwp01.usace.army.mil; marriott@lcrep.org; Martin.don@epa.gov;
Mary.Arkoosh@noaa.gov; masterson.kevin@deq.state.or.us;
mattgerbrandt@ctuir.com; mccarthy@usgs.gov; mgil461@ECY.WA.GOV;
mmcikay@wstribe.org; nancy.kohn@pnl.gov; nelson.walt@epa.gov;
olsen.tony@epa.gov; Olson.john@epa.gov; oneilsmo@dfw.wa.gov;
Palmer.john@epa.gov; parara.amber@epa.gov; Parkin.richard@epa.gov;
patti.bailey@colvilletribes.com; pedersen.dick@deq.state.or.us;
pinj@critfc.org; Pirzadeh.michelle@epa.gov; Poon.derek@epa.gov;
Powers.david@epa.gov; Psyk.christine@epa.gov;
rachael@columbiariverkeeper.org; relwood@yakama.com; rl.dirkes@pnl.gov;
rlaw461@ecy.wa.gov; robert.c.anderson@noaa.gov; rrichardson@wstribe.org;

(b) (6) rueda.helen@epa.gov; Salter.joel@epa.gov;
-assoc.com; schwarz.bob@deq.state.or.us;
Schweiss.jon@epa.gov; srsander@bpa.gov; stanv@ctsi.nsn.us;
stefan.fran@epa.gov; stuartharris@ctuir.com; susan.c.hughs@state.or.us;
swaste@nwcouncil.org; Thomas.sally@epa.gov;
timothy.j.sherman@usace.army.mil; tombailor@ctuir.com; tomcd@ctsi.nsn.us;
toni_davidson@fws.gov; Townsend.tom@epa.gov; Vallette.yvonne@epa.gov;
Vanhaagen.paula@epa.gov; Watson.michael@epa.gov; Werntz.james@epa.gov;
wken461@ECY.WA.GOV; wolgamott.mitch@deq.state.or.us; Woodruff.leigh@epa.gov;
Jennifer_bayer@usgs.gov; williamson.ann@epa.gov;
Gubitosa.Matt@epamail.epa.gov; Rodriguez.Socorro@epamail.epa.gov;
Soscia.Marylou@epamail.epa.gov; Nadeau.Tracie@epamail.epa.gov;
mcleod@battelle.org; lchulstr@wch-rcc.com; claudia.brow@noaa.gov;
Carter.Brad@epamail.epa.gov; cox.michael@epamail.epa.gov
Subject: Comment: Columbia River Toxics Reduction Working Group:

Michael and others,

I was reading a business paper this weekend and ran across an article regarding "goals," which we discussed at last week's working group meeting. The quote from the paper was "...I learned that for goal-setting to be worthwhile, a goal must meet certain criteria. The goal must be achievable, it must be time limited, and it must be measurable." If we really want our goals to be worthwhile, we are facing some difficulties. Without having the baseline data first, the progress in achieving our goals can not be measured (this was discussed at our meeting). Without the baseline, we also can not apply a meaningful timeframe, and we will not know if our goals are achievable. We need to obtain baseline data on toxics, both spatially and temporally, in order to develop meaningful goals. If we decide to key in on certain areas (for example, removal of contaminants from the Bonneville Dam area, where the problem has been quantified by the COE), we can be successful in establishing meaningful goals. If we say that PBDE loads to the basin will be reduced by 10 percent by 2011, we will not know if we are successful because we don't know the current loading. If we have a goal to ban the use of a toxic compound by a certain date, however, we can be successful. Just thinking out loud on this one.

Regards,

Joe Rinella, Supervisory Hydrologist
U.S. Geological Survey
2130 S.W. 5th Avenue
Portland, Oregon 97201

Email: jrinella@usgs.gov
Phone:(503)251-3278
FAX:(503)251-3470